

United States District Court Southern District of Texas

Case Number: 05CV1847

ATTACHMENT

Description:

☐ State Court Record ☒ State Court Record Continued

☐ Administrative Record

☒ Document continued - Part 9 of _____

☐ Exhibit to: _____
number(s) / letter(s) _____

Other: _____

1 that's all the face-to-face interview time I had
2 anyway, he walked out. Because he had been
3 combative with the aids before, I didn't want to
4 try to get him to come back and sit down.

5 Q. What about appearance? What did he
6 look like when you saw him in February?

7 A. He had a little more hair, didn't have
8 any evidence of any scratches on his head or
9 anything like that, was neatly groomed, same as
10 the first time.

11 Q. Dressed appropriately?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. I mean clean?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Hair combed?

16 A. Hair combed, was kempt, yes.

17 Q. What did you have then beside your
18 interview with him? Did you look at records?

19 A. Well, I reviewed quite a few records.
20 Treatment records by this time were pretty
21 thick, so I went through all of those, noted
22 again that everyone had pretty much documented
23 that he was really either malingering or he was
24 fine. There is fairly long periods of time in
25 the treatment notes where he is behaving

1 appropriately, he's not a management problem, he
2 is not giving anybody problems, he's not saying
3 anything strange, he is just kind of hanging
4 around, just there.

5 Q. How do you interpret that, that he
6 goes from the extreme bizarre behavior to
7 normal? I mean, just sitting there, not causing
8 a problem, not doing anything unusual? How do
9 you explain that?

10 A. Well, again, I think most of his
11 unusual behavior is saved for the doctors who
12 interview him, then rest of the time he is
13 pretty much kind of just behaving himself or at
14 least is quiet, doesn't do anything. No one who
15 is really normal but who is trying to play
16 mentally ill could keep up the string of
17 symptoms that they're showing day after day
18 after day, month after month.

19 Q. So did you see a general pattern, that
20 when he was just in his cell, without
21 psychiatrists or psychologists around, he wasn't
22 that much of a problem?

23 A. That's right.

24 Q. Generally speaking?

25 A. Generally speaking, that's what the

1 notes reflect.

2 Q. But then, when the psychiatrists or
3 psychologists came around, all of a sudden he
4 has got this bizarre behavior?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. How do you interpret that?

7 A. I interpret that as malingering. He
8 is faking mental illness.

9 Q. Why do you say that?

10 A. Well, again, the only time that we see
11 people who are faking in this situation is when
12 they're trying to avoid prosecution for their
13 crimes, and there is really no other reason that
14 someone in the jail would try to appear mentally
15 ill if they really weren't. There is no benefit
16 to it. There is really no benefit to Mr.
17 Eldridge doing it, but sometimes they get bad
18 advice from what they call jailhouse lawyers,
19 one of the inmates will say: Hey, if you fake
20 it, the doctors will send you to a mental
21 hospital or something, you know, you will get
22 out of this. But that's not true, that's not
23 the way it works. Even if he had been sent to a
24 mental hospital, he would of just come back, had
25 to stand trial eventually anyway, but, again,

1 they don't know about the law themselves, they
2 get bad advice, so they try it, it doesn't work,
3 but there is really no other reason for people
4 to do that. People, if you're really normal,
5 you don't want someone, for example, giving you
6 the psychiatric anti-psychotic medication. It's
7 not pleasant to take this medication. In
8 addition to the side effects, it's very
9 sedating, makes you sleep all the time, makes
10 you groggy, sluggish. No one likes that. It's
11 not a pleasant way to be. So there is really no
12 other reason for someone to try to fake mental
13 illness in the jail situation other than to try
14 to get out of their punishment.

15 Q. All right. Did you make notes about
16 the records as to what you found to be
17 particularly significant in your reaching your
18 diagnosis of malingering?

19 A. Yes, I did.

20 Q. Can you tell us about what you found
21 based on the MHMRA personnel records of the
22 defendant when they watched him, what was
23 significant about that in reaching your
24 diagnosis of malingering?

25 A. Well, again, I'd taken notes of

1 diagnoses and impressions from the different
2 doctors who had worked with Mr. Eldridge over
3 the past year, so.

4 Q. I guess let's try to break it down a
5 little bit. I'd like to just start with
6 October, if we can. In October, what did you
7 find particularly noteworthy about his stay with
8 the MHMRA at the jail?

9 A. In October, the jail treatment notes
10 -- okay, for example, after my October
11 evaluation, I talked with Mr. Pena, who is one
12 of the staff psychologists on the unit, and he
13 indicated that he thought that the defendant was
14 malingering and did not need any psychiatric
15 care. Also talked to psychiatric nurse on the
16 unit, Ms. Callahan. She indicated he was being
17 dramatic, theatrical, his symptoms were
18 contrived. He, as she put it, he put on a real
19 show. And she doesn't remember anytime it was
20 necessary to medicate him or that medication was
21 called for as part of his treatment. She also
22 noted he did not scratch his head until it bled
23 during the previous admission to the unit in
24 January of '93. So, once again, pretty much
25 everything I was getting from the treatment

1 staff, the treatment records at that time
2 indicated that he was faking this.

3 Q. What did the records reflect for the
4 month of November?

5 A. The next time I saw him, the records,
6 I've written number of notes that I reviewed in
7 my report, but he was released the first time
8 after observation in January or February of '93
9 with no diagnosis or as malingering, no
10 diagnosis of serious mental illness. He has
11 been given diagnosis of adjustment disorder
12 sometimes, but that sometimes is given together
13 with malingering because there the doctor is
14 trying to say that a person is having an
15 adjustment problem to the jail, which is why
16 they are malingering. The notes indicate, for
17 example, on October 6th of '93, no visual
18 hallucinations reported, depressed and tearful
19 at times. October 27th, he was described as
20 vague reporting of symptoms, says he cannot
21 read. October 13th, he was combative and
22 agitated on that day but he was also clear and
23 coherent, which is something you don't see.
24 October 21st, he was seen as no evidence of
25 psychotic behavior, selectively mute. That day

1 he wasn't talking to anybody.

2 Q. But he talked before?

3 A. Yes. November 11th, he denied
4 auditory, visual hallucination, he denied having
5 hallucinations on that day. Then he said his
6 brother visited him, which is implying he saw
7 his brother come into his jail tank or area or
8 something and he had a visit with him.

9 Q. What else did you notice about the
10 November records?

11 A. November 23rd, he said that the woman
12 in my head is burning candles. This is
13 interesting because the time I saw him before he
14 said something about a woman burning candles on
15 me. In other words, at that time it sounded
16 like he was talking about like a voodoo curse or
17 something, you burn candles, you know, puts a
18 curse on the person. But he'd forgotten what
19 said originally, I guess. Then he said there
20 was a woman in his head burning candles, making
21 his head hurt, which is, again, you never see
22 anything like that with mentally ill people.
23 Then he starts talking, on November 29th he
24 complained that his father was beating him,
25 drugging him in the jail.

1 Q. You said that in November that you
2 wrote that down?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Then in December what did you note?
5 December and January?

6 A. He reported visual hallucination in
7 detail, reported symptoms not typical of an
8 individual with a psychotic disorder. I think
9 this is the day he was supposedly seeing him and
10 his brother loading a truck. I don't know where
11 he got that from.

12 Q. Well, tell me about that, when you
13 have a hallucination, when people who have
14 mental illness describe how they have a
15 hallucination, what kind of visions they see.

16 A. Well, different kinds of mental
17 illness have different kinds of hallucinations.
18 Hallucinations are sensory misperceptions of
19 something that is happening. For example,
20 people with schizophrenia, a very serious mental
21 illness, typically hear voices, what we call an
22 auditory hallucination. They hear voices. But
23 they don't have -- they very rarely have visual
24 hallucination, very, very rare other than some
25 fleeting kind of shadows or vague things in the

1 periphery. Visual hallucinations are usually
2 reserved for people who are the drug overdoser,
3 what we call delirium problems, problems
4 associated with drug abuse or drug
5 intoxication. That seems to cause the visual
6 hallucinations. So you don't see that with any
7 other kind of disorder. So Mr. Eldridge, once
8 again, is seeing a lot of visual hallucinations,
9 like his brother, his father, he is loading a
10 truck. But, you see, there's no -- this is
11 months and months and months after he had any
12 access to any street drugs, if he ever used them
13 at all, so no possible way he would have had any
14 kind of actual drug organic, that would cause
15 him drug hallucination.

16 Q. Is it like tv, you know, you see
17 clear-cut images like on tv?

18 A. No, no, it's not like that at all.

19 Q. So he is actively seeing him and his
20 brother loading a truck. Does that sound like a
21 true hallucination?

22 A. No, that's not a hallucination.

23 Q. What about the fact he was saying he
24 was hearing things and seeing things, auditory
25 and visual hallucinations?

1 A. Well, at one point he reported
2 auditory, visual and even tactile, in other
3 words, skin feelings of some kind all at once,
4 which, again, I have never seen in my whole
5 life. I've never seen anything like that.

6 Q. Too much?

7 A. Too much.

8 Q. He went too far?

9 A. He went too far, too theatrical, too
10 intense.

11 Q. And just doesn't exist?

12 A. And it is too inconsistent.

13 Q. Does it exist?

14 A. Well, again, he really again didn't
15 demonstrate them to anyone, even psychiatric
16 residents still in training that he was really
17 seriously mentally ill.

18 Q. But in terms of auditory, visual,
19 tactile all at the same time, does that exist?

20 A. I've never seen that happen. I don't
21 think it exists. For example, tactile
22 hallucination you almost never see except with
23 maybe delirium tremors, which is alcohol
24 withdrawal.

25 Q. But at this point, he'd been in the

1 jail how long?

2 A. Months and months, maybe a year.

3 Q. Is that it with regards to your
4 February evaluation? Anything else that you did
5 besides your meeting with the defendant in the
6 jail and reviewing the reports?

7 A. Well, there is several other things,
8 but, again, I documented these in my report. I
9 think I note the most salient and dramatic kind
10 of instances, but there is a number of them.
11 Again, I think I pretty well covered that in my
12 report.

13 Q. Okay. Let me ask you very briefly
14 about the other doctors. For example, on
15 January 14th of 1993, how did Doctor Arfa
16 diagnose him at the jail?

17 A. He said no Axis I diagnosis. In other
18 words, Axis I is the category that is used for
19 diagnosing a mental disorder. And, in other
20 words, he is saying there's no mental disorder
21 that I could diagnose for the person.

22 Q. Was there any medication prescribed at
23 that time?

24 A. He said medications are not prescribed
25 or medications none. In other words, none are

1 needed.

2 Q. On January 25th of 1993, that's when
3 Doctor Silverman diagnosed malingering; is that
4 right?

5 A. That's right. That's Doctor
6 Silverman's first contact with the defendant, I
7 believe.

8 Q. On February the 19th of 1993, how did
9 Doctor Osterman diagnose the defendant?

10 A. He also says malingering. He called
11 him an adjustment disorder with depressed mood,
12 affect tearful but in a forced manner,
13 medication needed, none, no forensic services
14 needed. In other words, no psychiatric services
15 needed in the jail.

16 Q. Tell me about the adjustment disorder
17 with depressed mood. Would that affect your
18 diagnosis of malingering?

19 A. No. Like I said earlier, it sometimes
20 goes with diagnosis of malingering. In other
21 words, the doctor is just trying to explain this
22 person is having some kind of problem adjusting
23 or accepting or dealing properly with the fact
24 that he is charged with a criminal offense.

25 Q. Would the fact that somebody might

1 genuinely have, what is it, adjustment disorder
2 with depressed mood, would that mean that
3 they're incompetent to stand trial, that they
4 don't understand the legal proceedings or they
5 can't consult with their lawyer?

6 A. No. An adjustment disorder is a
7 milder or a less serious diagnosis of mental
8 disorder or mental problems.

9 Q. Assuming you agree that he had
10 adjustment disorder with depressed mood, would
11 that lead you to believe that he is incompetent
12 to stand trial?

13 A. No, that's not consistent with
14 diagnosis of incompetency.

15 Q. So that he could be competent to stand
16 trial and have this adjustment disorder?

17 A. We see that many times.

18 Q. Is that, in fact, your opinion of Mr.
19 Eldridge?

20 A. I believe so, yes.

21 Q. On March the third of 1993, how did
22 Doctor Arfa diagnose him at that time?

23 A. Doctor Arfa, this was his discharge
24 note or his discharge diagnosis was none or
25 malingering and that medications were none.

1 Q. And on March the 8th of 1993, how did
2 Doctor Stone diagnose him at that time?

3 A. He was seen by Doctor Marvin Stone,
4 who is the medical director of the psychiatric
5 unit there in the jail, and his impression was
6 also malingerer. He gave an adjustment
7 disorder. Felt no psychiatric treatment was
8 needed at that time.

9 Q. Did he make any observation whether,
10 what is it, his affect?

11 A. Yes. He did say his affect was overly
12 dramatic, that he tended to work himself into a
13 frenzy, so he was kind of working himself up,
14 similar to what he did with me when I first saw
15 him.

16 Q. All right. On September 30th, 1993,
17 that's when Doctor Silverman saw him again, said
18 he was malingerer; is that right?

19 A. That's right.

20 Q. Then, on October 5th of 1993, Doctor
21 Stokes gave what diagnosis?

22 A. Doctor Stokes felt like he was
23 malingerer, he said a mild adjustment disorder,
24 not otherwise specified.

25 Q. Is that N.O.S.?

1 A. Yes. And also on that same day, Henry
2 Ubah, which is, I think, is one of the
3 caseworkers, mental health caseworkers entered a
4 note: Possible mild adjustment disorder not
5 otherwise specified, no evidence of mental
6 illness, no services needed.

7 Q. What about, then you saw him on
8 October 13th of '93; is that right?

9 A. Yes. I saw him on the last time. I
10 am sorry, the first time in October of '93.

11 Q. Then, on January the 4th of 1994,
12 Doctor Melissa Ferguson documented what in the
13 records?

14 A. Doctor Ferguson said she highly
15 suspected malingering, doesn't happen to be
16 psychotic or suffering from an Axis I major
17 depression.

18 Q. Then, on February the 8th, 1994,
19 Doctor Robashkin gave what diagnosis?

20 A. Robashkin is one of the heads of the
21 treatment teams there in the jail. He diagnosed
22 him as malingering. Felt that he had no place
23 on a psychiatric unit.

24 Q. Earlier this morning you and I got
25 together and discussed this chart. Without

1 telling me the contents of this chart, can you
2 just identify the chart and tell me whether that
3 fairly and accurately, to the best of your
4 knowledge, summarizes the different people who
5 have seen the defendant on different dates and
6 their diagnoses and impressions?

7 A. I believe it does, yes.

8 Q. All right. We marked State's Exhibits
9 6 and 5; is that right?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. So this is fair and accurate, to the
12 best of your knowledge?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. All right.

15 MS. ALCALA: At this time, I'd like to
16 tender to defense counsel State's Exhibits 5 and
17 6, offer them into evidence.

18 MS. CRAWFORD: Your Honor, may we
19 approach the bench?

20 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.

21 (Off the record bench conference).

22 MS. ALCALA: Any objection?

23 MS. CRAWFORD: No objection.

24 THE COURT: Five and six will be
25 admitted.

1 BY MS. ALCALA:

2 Q. Sir, rather than repeating what we
3 just talked about, do State's Exhibits 5 and 6,
4 then, summarize what you just testified to there
5 on the witness stand?

6 A. Yes, they do.

7 Q. That would be all the different
8 doctors who have seen him and all of the
9 different diagnoses that those people have given
10 and the dates of that diagnosis?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Okay. Sir, you said you made reports
13 of your visits. Did you bring those reports?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. We marked those as State's Exhibits 7
16 and 8.

17 MS. ALCALA: I'm going to tender to
18 Defense Counsel State's Exhibits 7 and 8, offer
19 them into evidence, with the same understanding
20 as the previous ones, that we'll agree to
21 certain omissions that the court has ruled
22 inadmissible.

23 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.

24 MS. ALCALA: Any objection with that
25 understanding?

1 MS. CRAWFORD: No objection, Your Honor.

2 BY MS. ALCALA:

3 Q. Sir, would it be your practice to give
4 somebody an anti-psychotic drug if you didn't
5 know what was wrong with them?

6 A. That's really not a good idea. These
7 drugs are very powerful. They have some very
8 significant effects on people. Different drugs
9 are used for different kinds of diagnoses, and
10 giving the wrong drug to someone could possibly
11 hurt them. Again, because of their rather
12 powerful nature, I don't think I would recommend
13 that. It's not something you experiment with.

14 Q. Sir, do you have an opinion, then,
15 about whether Gerald Eldridge has the ability to
16 assist his attorney with a reasonable degree of
17 rational understanding?

18 A. If he decides to do so, I think he
19 could voluntarily do this, yes.

20 Q. He has the ability if he chooses to do so?

21 A. That's right.

22 Q. And do you have an opinion about
23 whether Mr. Eldridge has a rational as well as
24 factual understanding of the legal proceedings
25 against him?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. The ability if he chooses to do so?

3 A. I believe he would be able to do so,
4 yes.

5 MS. ALCALA: I'll pass the witness.

6

7 CROSS EXAMINATION

8 BY MS. CRAWFORD:

9 Q. Is it Doctor Brown?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Doctor Brown, my name is Denise
12 Crawford. I believe we met in the past. You
13 may or may not remember.

14 It's my understanding that you had the
15 opportunity on two occasions to visit with Mr.
16 Eldridge; is that correct?

17 A. That's correct.

18 Q. Okay. The first time, I believe,
19 well, let me ask you where exactly was -- you
20 say it was an interview room?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. That's in the forensic unit. I mean
23 in the medical unit?

24 A. On the psychiatric unit that's on the
25 third floor of the central jail building, 1301

1 Franklin.

2 Q. So that's not on the sixth floor?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Sixth floor is general population, so
5 to speak?

6 A. I think it is, yes.

7 Q. So it's not the medical unit, medical
8 floor?

9 A. As far as I know, it's not.

10 Q. And did you proceed with an order of
11 the court at that time?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Okay. And was it in a room where you
14 were given the opportunity to interview him
15 without any barriers; is that correct?

16 A. Right.

17 Q. So, basically, as if you and I were
18 talking, we may even be closer than that?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Certainly no barriers?

21 A. Right.

22 Q. Would you agree that at sometimes it's
23 difficult to carry out your job when there are
24 barriers between you and the patient?

25 A. Well, I certainly prefer not to, yes.

1 Q. Okay. And you indicated at that time
2 that Mr. Eldridge I think you said worked
3 himself into an agitated state; is that correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Now, I am a lay person, as I guess
6 most people here in this courtroom are. You
7 indicated that you weren't able to detect any
8 specific diagnosis of mental illness.

9 A. Right.

10 Q. Doctor Brown, are you saying, that in
11 order for you to determine that an individual is
12 competent or incompetent, it's necessary for you
13 to form a conclusion or some form of conclusion
14 as to a specific mental illness before you can
15 render that opinion?

16 A. No, I don't think it's actually
17 necessary to make a diagnosis. Frankly, in my
18 reports, I rarely give a diagnosis like of a
19 psychiatric mental illness in the reports. I
20 will say he is seriously mentally ill or
21 something like that, but I would not give a
22 diagnosis because that's not what the court is
23 asking for.

24 Q. I understand, but in your mind have
25 you at least considered one or two possible

1 diagnoses or types of mental illness, then you
2 decide, okay, I'm going to conclude that he is
3 basically incompetent?

4 A. Yes. In other words, I would know
5 what was making him incompetent, yes.

6 Q. So I guess that's my question. Did
7 you have to know what is rendering him
8 incompetent before you could say he or she is
9 incompetent?

10 A. That's right.

11 Q. Now, you mentioned there are different
12 forms of mental illness. I certainly would not
13 presume to ask you to list all of them, but you
14 did indicate some examples that indicated
15 paranoid schizophrenia; is that correct?

16 A. Right.

17 Q. You also indicated one type of mental
18 illness, I don't remember, maybe it was
19 schizophrenia, that medical students learn that
20 there are certain symptoms on which to base a
21 diagnosis of possible schizophrenia; is that
22 correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Now, with paranoia, for example, I'm
25 just asking for understanding here, what would

1 be some of the symptoms present in a possible
2 paranoia type of situation?

3 A. Well, the paranoia that is usually
4 reflected in paranoid schizophrenia is it's
5 usually a persecutory form. In other words,
6 person believes there is some type of plot or
7 conspiracy or some type of evil force that is
8 after him and trying to harm him in some kind of
9 way. And it's also what we call
10 self-preferential. In other words, the person
11 believes this force is being used against him
12 because he has some kind of special ability,
13 power or some kind of special assignment, and
14 they're trying to keep him from doing it. In
15 other words, you got to have both the
16 persecutorial quality to it, you also have to
17 have the self-preferential quality to it to be a
18 true paranoid schizophrenic delusion.

19 Q. They're always willing to express
20 their feelings?

21 A. No, not always. Sometimes they
22 withhold a lot of their feelings and thoughts
23 from us because there is suspicious of us.

24 Q. And I believe you indicated that the
25 problem that you have, it's been said, I guess,

1 in the reports that Mr. Eldridge basically
2 produced too large an array of the problems or
3 symptoms from too many different types of mental
4 illnesses; is that correct?

5 A. Too dramatic, too many different
6 kinds.

7 Q. Okay. Now, what about -- the paranoid
8 schizophrenia, they go hand in hand but they can
9 be considered separately; is that correct?

10 A. Paranoid schizophrenia is one of the
11 classifications of schizophrenia. There are
12 several forms of it.

13 Q. Okay. Now, what are some of the
14 symptoms of schizophrenia, I guess?

15 A. Well, there is two ways to diagnose
16 schizophrenia, and these are the kinds of things
17 that are taught the residents and clinical
18 psychology interns in medical school is what
19 they call the four A's. The four A's meaning
20 inappropriate affect, loose associations, autism
21 and ambivalence.

22 Q. What is autism?

23 A. Autism is a focus of the patient
24 inside of himself rather than outside of
25 himself. In other words, usually people in the

1 normal world are focused outside of themselves,
2 they're checking what's going on around them,
3 relate to people around them in the appropriate
4 way. The schizophrenic turns inward, something
5 going on inside of his head that he is compelled
6 to focus and compel, pay attention to that more
7 than the world outside.

8 Q. How is that manifested in the actions
9 of one?

10 A. Well, it can be manifested several
11 ways. One of the most common ways is what we
12 call the smile or the laughter. In other words,
13 sometimes you'll be talking to a schizophrenic
14 and they'll laugh. You will say what are you
15 laughing about and, well, nothing, but you can
16 tell that they're either listening to or
17 thinking about something inside their heads and
18 they're laughing about it. Another form of -- I
19 am sorry, what was your question again?

20 Q. You basically answered that.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. And ambivalence, what is that?

23 A. Well, ambivalence in this case refers
24 to inability to make a decision about anything
25 that's important. They want to do this, but

1 they want to do that, they don't know which to
2 do, they keep going back and forth between the
3 two. Uncertain, unfocused, they get confused,
4 they don't know which thing they're suppose to
5 be doing, and they have to be directed or told
6 how to go about doing things, like do you want
7 to leave now? They might say, well, I don't
8 know, I can't tell, I'm not sure, should I,
9 maybe I shouldn't, you know. Then you say,
10 well, then I think it's time for you to leave.
11 Then you have to escort them out.

12 Q. Is it your opinion that a person with
13 a true mental illness is not capable of, in
14 addition to that mental illness, being
15 manipulatory in other ways? I mean, if you're
16 mentally ill, does that stop you from perhaps
17 possessing other characteristics that a normal
18 person might possess?

19 A. No, the mentally ill person, let's say
20 the seriously mentally ill person is able to
21 some extent to relate to the world and behave
22 appropriately and respond to people. For
23 example, if you go in the unit right now you
24 might see a dozen or so of them sitting in the
25 tank eating their dinner and they look okay

1 eating their dinner.

2 Q. I guess what I'm asking is, I'll just
3 ask it pointblank, would it be possible for a
4 person with some form of mental illness to
5 malinger additionally?

6 A. I guess it's possible theoretically.
7 I've just never seen it. I've never heard of
8 that happening.

9 Q. Do you understand my question? Let's
10 say in a hypothetical situation a person shows
11 symptoms of paranoia, they know they're in
12 trouble; however, because they're like normal
13 people, they know maybe, for example, charged
14 with a crime, and they know, I believe you said
15 most people like that want to try to get out of
16 it so perhaps they feign, and then they add
17 symptoms not really realizing that they don't
18 have to do that.

19 A. Yeah, it's possible to kind of make up
20 a story like that or a scenario like that, but
21 the truth is, that when a person is genuinely
22 seriously mentally ill, what is going on with
23 them is so compelling, it is so disturbing, it
24 is so powerful that they simply don't have the
25 energy and focus to pull off something that's

1 totally not like themselves. These people are
2 self-preoccupied, they're self-absorbed. They
3 can hardly hold on to, you know, their own
4 behavior from one time to the next, let alone
5 manufacture and create a whole new set of
6 symptoms. That's why you really just don't see
7 anything like that.

8 Q. Now one thing, Doctor Brown, you said
9 that I made note of. You found in the two
10 interviews you had with Mr. Eldridge that he was
11 neatly groomed?

12 A. Yes, he was.

13 Q. You did not detect any odor coming
14 from him?

15 A. No, not a bit.

16 Q. That his hair was kempt, his hair or
17 facial hair was intact?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Okay. You did indicate that the first
20 visit that you had, I am sorry, second visit you
21 had with Mr. Eldridge lasted from approximately
22 five to ten minutes; is that correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. So, to be save, and I could be wrong,
25 but in the second interview you really didn't

1 get anything specific out of it because he was
2 not very cooperative; is that correct?

3 A. What I noted in my report is not very
4 much.

5 Q. Right, but you did have the benefit of
6 the medical records from the treatment team?

7 A. Right.

8 Q. And based on I guess your previous
9 experiences with Mr. Eldridge and the treatment
10 team's experiences, that's basically all you had
11 to go on; right?

12 A. That's right, that's all I had.

13 Q. Now, you did say in that one interview
14 something you found tremendously revealing were
15 his words, were his responses and acknowledgment
16 to the word court?

17 A. Right.

18 Q. In the previous interview, he didn't
19 know what specific court words. He basically
20 said he didn't know to everything?

21 A. Yeah, he didn't know why he was in
22 jail, he didn't know why he was there, he didn't
23 know what he was accused of doing.

24 Q. And you consider that revealing in the
25 second interview?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. But isn't it true, Doctor Brown, that
3 in the first interview you considered that as
4 one of the -- the failure of Mr. Eldridge to
5 cooperate and to say what court meant or what
6 lawyer meant or what judge meant indicated to
7 you that he was malingering?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So, if he had gone into the second
10 interview and maintained that position, you
11 still would have considered it malingering?

12 A. Well, the first time I saw him I would
13 expect him, as almost anyone, even one who is
14 mentally ill, to be able to say something about
15 his life and be aware of some aspects of his
16 life in kind of a reasonable way. In other
17 words, just because you're mentally ill doesn't
18 mean you forget who you are, where you are, why
19 you are.

20 Q. That's what you did at the second
21 interview, but did you consider that revealing
22 as to the first interview?

23 A. First interview revealing he didn't
24 say anything about court, because this is so
25 prominent for these people. In other words,

1 here they are in jail. That's the whole reason
2 that they're there at this moment, they're not
3 there voluntarily, so really takes some really
4 serious problems before a person loses contact
5 with reality so much they don't even know
6 they're in jail and that jail is related to a
7 court charge.

8 Q. I understand that.

9 A. Now, the second time he is seen, this
10 man has been in jail for at least a year, to my
11 knowledge, you see.

12 Q. Uh-hum?

13 A. And he is saying something at this
14 point about going to court.

15 Q. Well, by your own testimony, you would
16 expect even a person with a very serious mental
17 illness to have some knowledge of that.

18 A. That's right.

19 Q. So that would not be consistent, that
20 would not be inconsistent?

21 A. Well, I think it's inconsistent that
22 he still does not reveal enough knowledge about
23 court. In other words, he knows he's going to
24 court but, then, that's all you get out of him,
25 you know; he is not willing to tell you anything

1 else about what why he is there or anything.
2 You see, after a year in jail, all he can say is
3 something about that he went to court. It's too
4 little, it's still too little.

5 Q. Okay. The leg shaking. Nervous
6 people don't shake their leg?

7 A. Nervous people do shake their leg.

8 Q. I mean--

9 A. But it's not in a vigorous and
10 dramatic way that he was shaking it, number one;
11 number two, they do it consistently.

12 Q. And his referring to them, don't let
13 them kill me, them could be anybody; is that
14 correct?

15 A. Right.

16 Q. And isn't it possible that could be a
17 symptom of paranoia?

18 A. If that was all I saw in him, it could
19 be, that's right. Paranoias are afraid of being
20 killed sometimes.

21 Q. So, basically, by your testimony, the
22 problem with diagnosing or concluding that Mr.
23 Eldridge is anything but a malingerer is the
24 fact, that although he may possess certain
25 symptoms for certain appropriate mental

1 illnesses, there are other things present which
2 make it, in your opinion, inappropriate; is that
3 correct?

4 A. Right.

5 Q. Also something that you said, Doctor
6 Brown, you indicated that he didn't want to go
7 back into the unit.

8 A. Right.

9 Q. That you found that unusual because
10 most people don't want, at least, I guess with
11 respect to paranoias, or any type -- was it
12 specific mental illness?

13 A. Usually could be paranoias, could be
14 other reasons.

15 Q. They don't like the people that they
16 are not familiar with?

17 A. Right.

18 Q. Well, could it have been that he
19 didn't want to go back into the room? You don't
20 know what's going on in his mind; do you?

21 A. Well, I don't know what's going on in
22 his mind. You know, again, I have a reasonable
23 estimate about what is going on in his mind;
24 but, of course, I don't really factually know
25 what's going on in his mind.

1 Q. Your science is based on opinions of
2 groups of studies done in the past. That's
3 basically what it is; isn't that correct?

4 A. Well, even more succinctly, I think
5 it's basically made on probabilities.

6 Q. And I wonder when do you think was the
7 first diagnosis of paranoia made?

8 A. In the world you mean?

9 Q. Yes, in the world. How long ago?

10 A. Oh, gosh. Probably in the late
11 1800's.

12 Q. Does that suggest there weren't any
13 paranoias before then?

14 A. Oh, no. No. The McNaughton rule
15 itself took place in 1842, so there was
16 awareness of mental illness at that time.

17 Q. So the problem is a psychiatrist or
18 psychologist from 1842 would not have had the
19 benefit of the studies made with respect to the
20 paranoia that was established in the late
21 1800's?

22 A. Right. For example, again McNaughton
23 was that the insane person at that time, they
24 didn't call him paranoid in those days, they
25 called him mentally ill or something like that,

1 but they didn't have that diagnosis at that
2 time.

3 Q. I guess what I'm saying, Doctor Brown,
4 you may consider it bizarre, but twenty-five or
5 fifty years from now if a Doctor Jones is able
6 to discern a certain type of mental illness and
7 Gerald Eldridge fits it like a glove, I guess
8 the sad thing about it is fifty years will have
9 passed and history would have already been made;
10 isn't that correct?

11 A. Well, in fifty years we may have some
12 scientific diagnosis that shows that, but I
13 really doubt it.

14 Q. Okay.

15 MS. CRAWFORD: I'll pass the witness,
16 Your Honor.

1 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MS. ALCALA:

3 Q. I missed your words, your last
4 sentence. What was your last sentence?

5 A. I said that may happen in fifty years,
6 there may be a diagnostic category that somehow
7 combines all this large group of symptoms that
8 we're seeing with Mr. Eldridge into one
9 comprehensive single diagnosis, but I really
10 doubt it.

11 Q. Okay. I just couldn't hear the
12 words. I don't have any further questions.

13 MS. CRAWFORD: No more, Your Honor.

14 THE COURT: May Doctor Brown be
15 excused?

16 MS. CRAWFORD: Yes, sir.

17 MS. ALCALA: Yes, sir.

18 THE COURT: Members of the jury, let's
19 take a short recess. If you will, please, step
20 back into the jury room. Let's take about a
21 five minute break.

22 (State's Exhibit 9 marked for
23 identification).

24 (Recess; after which, the jury enters
25 the courtroom).

1 THE COURT: You may call your next
2 witness.

3 MS. ALCALA: Officer Adams.

4 THE COURT: Deputy, raise your right
5 hand.

6 A. R. ALLEN
7 was called as a witness by the State and, having
8 been duly sworn, testified as follows:

9 DIRECT EXAMINATION

10 BY MS. ALCALA:

11 Q. Can you, please, state your name?

12 A. Deputy Angela Allen.

13 Q. I'm sorry, I said Adams. Where do you
14 work?

15 A. I work commissary at 1301 Franklin,
16 the jail.

17 Q. You are a deputy with the sheriff's
18 department?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What's a commissary?

21 A. Commissary is a place where the
22 inmates can order, purchase items that they
23 can't get any other way. We sell them things
24 like hygiene products, legal products, excess
25 food, junk food, cookies, things like that.

1 Q. You're a convenience store for the
2 jail?

3 A. Kroger's.

4 Q. Okay. How do they pay for what
5 they're getting from you?

6 A. They have what we call an inmate trust
7 fund. They have to go through the bank, someone
8 has to send them money by money order or bring
9 it personally to the jail and put it onto what
10 they call their books, which is their trust
11 fund. That's how they purchase things is
12 through their trust fund. They have, let's see,
13 people put the money in, then they make an
14 order, whoever can take it out for buying
15 things, like commissary is allowed to take money
16 out for their orders, medical department is
17 allowed to take them out for their expenses and
18 so on.

19 Q. How do you know who in fact is the
20 person getting the items?

21 A. Okay, our system is, when they order,
22 they have an order form they fill out, they put
23 their name, spin number and they sign it. At
24 this point, we fill the order through the
25 computer, we take it up to their tank, their

1 location where they're housed, we ask for the
2 right thumb print and signature, and we check
3 their arm band to make sure that the spin number
4 on their paper matches the number on their arm
5 band.

6 Q. I asked you to bring me some records
7 regarding an inmate by the name of Gerald
8 Eldridge; is that right?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. I'll hand you what has been marked as
11 State's Exhibit No. 9. Do you recognize those
12 documents?

13 A. Yes, ma'am, I do.

14 Q. Okay, are you the custodian of records
15 for those documents?

16 A. Yes, ma'am, I am.

17 Q. What are the documents just by title?

18 A. These are, well, they're called the,
19 they're order forms. Once they have been filled
20 out and entered into the computer, that's what
21 it looks like. They're order forms.

22 Q. Are those all of the records that the
23 commissary department has in regards to Gerald
24 Eldridge?

25 A. Yes, ma'am, it is.

1 Q. Is State's Exhibit No. 9 records that
2 are made in the regular course of business?

3 A. Yes, they are.

4 Q. Is State's Exhibit No. 9 records that
5 are kept in the regular course of business?

6 A. Yes, they are.

7 Q. And is that record, the entries in the
8 records, are they made at or near the time that
9 the records are made?

10 A. Yes, they are.

11 Q. And is State's Exhibit No. 9, the
12 entries made by or from people with knowledge of
13 the contents that they're putting in the
14 records?

15 A. Yes, they are.

16 Q. You're actually the custodian of those
17 records?

18 A. These records, yes, I am.

19 Q. Are you actually the person that
20 xeroxed those originals?

21 A. I am.

22 Q. Made copies?

23 A. I am.

24 Q. You remember that?

25 A. I remember that.